



**Horsham
District
Council**

DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT REPORT

TO: Development Management Committee (South)

BY: Development Manager

DATE: 18 October 2016

DEVELOPMENT: Erection of a two storey side extension to form new kitchen and living space and bedroom above. Alterations to existing building to replan bedroom at ground floor and provide shower room at first floor (Listed Building)

SITE: Shaw Cottage Blackstone Lane Blackstone Henfield

WARD: Bramber, Upper Beeding and Woodmancote

APPLICATION: DC/16/1804

APPLICANT: Mr Keith Toogood

REASON FOR INCLUSION ON THE AGENDA: More than 5 letters of support have been received.

RECOMMENDATION: To refuse Listed Building Consent

1. THE PURPOSE OF THIS REPORT

To consider the planning application.

DESCRIPTION OF THE APPLICATION

- 1.1 The application seeks Listed Building Consent for a two storey extension to the later barn addition. The proposed extension would incorporate a two storey element to the east and flat roof addition to the south.
- 1.2 The two storey extension would extend 6m from the eastern elevation, to a total depth of 5.2m, with a first floor addition within the existing cat-slide out-shut to a depth of 2.5m and a width of 4m. The proposed two storey extension would incorporate a full height glazed link to separate the main structure from the existing barn, and would incorporate a half-hipped roof extending to an overall height of 7.4m.
- 1.3 A single storey flat roof addition is also proposed, extending from the two storey addition by an additional depth of 2.2m and width of 6m. The single storey flat roof addition would extend to an overall height of 2.5m.
- 1.4 The proposal would incorporate horizontal feather edged cladding to the cat-slide out-shut, with lead sheet cladding to the first floor walls of the two storey extension. Full height glazing would be provided to the north and east elevations, with plain clay tiles to the roof.

ITEM A07 - 2

DESCRIPTION OF THE SITE

- 1.5 The application site is a Grade II Listed Building positioned to the east of Blackstone Lane, outside of the designated built up area. The site includes the original Grade II Listed Building, and an attached Sussex barn which was re-located to the site from elsewhere in the District (planning refs: WK/11/00 and WK/12/00).
- 1.6 The Listed element of the application site is a timber framed building with white render infill that sits within a relatively large site bound by mature hedging to the south and west, and post and rail fencing open to the surrounding countryside to the north.

2. INTRODUCTION

STATUTORY BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

RELEVANT GOVERNMENT POLICY

- 2.2 **National Planning Policy Framework:**
 - NPPF7 - Requiring good design
 - NPPF12 - Conserving and enhancing the historic environment
 - NPPF14 - Presumption in favour of sustainable development

RELEVANT COUNCIL POLICY

- 2.3 **Horsham District Planning Framework (HDPF 2015)**
 - HDPF1 - Strategic Policy: Sustainable Development
 - HDPF2 - Strategic Policy: Strategic Development
 - HDPF25 - Strategic Policy: The Natural Environment and Landscape Character
 - HDPF28 - Replacement Dwellings and House Extensions in the Countryside
 - HDPF32 - Strategic Policy: The Quality of New Development
 - HDPF33 - Development Principles
 - HDPF34 - Cultural and Heritage Assets

RELEVANT NEIGHBOURHOOD PLAN

- 2.4 **Henfield Neighbourhood Plan 2015 -2035** (Made April 2016)

Policy 1 – A Spatial Plan
Policy 12 – Design

PLANNING HISTORY

- 2.5

| | | |
|----------|---|-----|
| WK/12/00 | Alterations 2-storey extension and glazed link Site: Shaw Cottage Blackstone Lane Blackstone | PER |
|----------|---|-----|

3. OUTCOME OF CONSULTATIONS

- 3.1 When consultation responses have been summarised, it should be noted that Officers have had consideration of the full comments received, which are available to view on the public file at www.horsham.gov.uk

ITEM A07 - 3

INTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

- 3.2 Design and Conservation Officer: Objection in principle as the proposal is considered to have an adverse impact upon the special character and built form of the heritage asset.

OUTSIDE AGENCIES

- 3.3 N/A

PUBLIC CONSULTATIONS

- 3.4 Parish Council: No Objection, but request no floodlighting be used and all drainage requirements are met.

Seven letters of support were received, and these can be summarised as follows:

- Proposal would benefit the use of the property
- No impact upon amenities of neighbours
- In keeping with the character of the site

4. HOW THE PROPOSED COURSE OF ACTION WILL PROMOTE HUMAN RIGHTS

- 4.1 Article 8 (Right to respect of a Private and Family Life) and Article 1 of the First Protocol (Protection of Property) of the Human Rights Act 1998 are relevant to this application, Consideration of Human rights forms part of the planning assessment below.

5. HOW THE PROPOSAL WILL HELP TO REDUCE CRIME AND DISORDER

- 5.1 It is not considered that the development would be likely to have any significant impact on crime and disorder.

6. PLANNING ASSESSMENTS

- 6.1 The application seeks Listed Building Consent for a two storey extension to the later barn addition, with a single storey flat roof addition to the south. The key consideration is the impact of the proposal on the character, appearance and significance of the Listed Building.
- 6.2 Policy 34 of the Horsham District Planning Framework states that development affecting Listed Buildings and their setting should protect, conserve, and/or enhance the setting and distinctiveness of Listed Buildings, and should seek to reinforce and make a positive contribution to the special character, through appropriate use of materials and building techniques.
- 6.3 The two storey extension would extend 6m from the eastern elevation of the barn, to a total depth of 5.2m, incorporating a full height glazed link to separate the proposed extension from the existing barn, with a half-hipped roof extending to an overall height of 7.4m. A single storey flat roof addition is also proposed, extending from the two storey addition by an additional depth of 2.2m and width of 6m. This would extend in a similar manner to the existing cat-slide out-shut, and would incorporate a flat roof addition that would extend to an overall height of 2.5m.
- 6.4 The proposed form of the extension would be in stark contrast to the vernacular and style of the cottage, and would introduce a number of glazed elements to the north, south and east elevations that are considered to overwhelm the composition and appearance of the

ITEM A07 - 4

utilitarian barn. These features and finishes are not considered to relate contextually with the character and distinctiveness of the barn or host listed dwelling, resulting in a visually discordant addition that would overwhelm the character and local vernacular of the host dwelling.

- 6.5 Whilst it is acknowledged that the proposed design approach is modern, seeking to provide a visual break to the main bulk of the barn, the proposed scale, mass and bulk is considered to be out of context and proportion with the original listed dwelling and its later (barn) addition. This impact would be exacerbated by the proposed materials, which would not reflect the traditional finishes of either the original listed building or later barn extension. The extension would result in an overly large addition which would create a poor and visually harmful contrast with the modest size of the listed building. The proposal would therefore upset the overall composition of the barn, appearing as a disproportionate addition that would result in the further overdevelopment of the already heavily extended principal listed dwelling.
- 6.6 The Design and Access and Heritage Statement submitted states that further ancillary accommodation is required to update the layout and circulation of the original historic cottage. It is contended that the proposal would rationalise the somewhat awkward disposition and relationship of the kitchen to the main living spaces in the barn, with a bedroom at first floor level. Whilst it is acknowledged that the upper rooms of the Listed Building are constrained by the door openings, it is recognised that the dwelling in its existing form benefits from a reasonable level of accommodation which includes 2 x bedrooms, study, snug, and lounge (all of which extend across the host listed dwelling and the later barn addition). There is concern that the realignment of the accommodation would result in the loss of day-to-day facilities within the principal listed dwelling, and the subsequent loss of use to this part of the building and its function as a dwelling
- 6.7 As such, there is an in principle objection to the proposed extension as the proposal is considered to have an adverse, permanent, and irreversible harmful impact upon the special character and distinctiveness of the listed dwelling, contrary to policies 33 and 34 of the Horsham District Planning Framework.

Conclusion

- 6.12 The proposed two storey extension is considered to have an adverse, permanent, and irreversible harmful impact upon the special character and distinctiveness of the Listed Building, and is not considered to conserve, enhance, or make a positive contribution to, the Listed Building or its setting, contrary to policy 34 of the Horsham District Planning Framework (2015).

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the application be refused for the following reason(s):

- 1 The proposed two storey extension to the later barn addition would be of a design, scale, mass and bulk that would result in an unacceptable, permanent, and irreversible adverse impact upon the special character and distinctiveness of the Listed Building, resulting in an overtly large, disproportionate and visually discordant addition that would contribute to the incremental and cumulative erosion of the immediate setting of the cottage. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies 32, 33 and 34 of the Horsham District Planning Framework (2015).